

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ETHICON WAVE 5 MOTIONS</b>	<b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

**DEFENDANTS' REPLY BRIEF SUPPORTING MOTION TO EXCLUDE  
CERTAIN GENERAL OPINIONS OF JERRY BLAIVAS, M.D.**

Defendants Ethicon, Inc. and Johnson & Johnson (collectively "Ethicon") submit this reply brief in further support of their motion to exclude certain general opinions of Jerry G. Blaivas, M.D., in this wave of cases. Ethicon hereby adopts and incorporates by reference all of the arguments that it presented as part of its reply brief in the Wave 4 cases. *See* Doc. 3840.

As it relates to Ethicon's additional argument that Dr. Blaivas should be precluded from providing general opinions about Prolift +M on the basis that he has not disclosed any opinions with respect to that device, that argument only applies to one case (Monnica Reyes in Case No. 2:12-cv-06141), which is no longer included in this wave of cases by agreement. Accordingly, that argument is now moot and Ethicon withdraws this particular challenge.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Christy D. Jones

Christy D. Jones  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4523  
[Christy.jones@butlersnow.com](mailto:Christy.jones@butlersnow.com)

/s/ David B. Thomas

David B. Thomas (W. Va. Bar #3731)  
Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC  
300 Summers Street  
Suite 1380 (25301)  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 25338  
(304) 414-1807  
[dthomas@tcspllc.com](mailto:dthomas@tcspllc.com)

Counsel for Defendants Ethicon, Inc. and  
Johnson & Johnson

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ETHICON WAVE 5 CASES</b>	<b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Christy D. Jones, certify that on this date, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ Christy D. Jones

Christy D. Jones  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4523  
christy.jones@butlersnow.com